



## PROGRAMME

EXPER Conference

***Glocalized Experiences of Heritage:***

***Imaginaires and Appropriations of World Heritage Historical and Religious sites***

Expériences glocalisées du patrimoine : Imaginaires, appropriations et conflits d'usage de sites historiques et religieux inscrits au patrimoine mondial

1-2 JUNE 2023, Greater Paris (Métro line 8, station Liberté)

Auditorium, [Médiathèque du patrimoine et de la photographie, 11 rue du Séminaire de Conflans, Charenton-le-Pont](#)

*This conference represents the culmination of phase 1 of the EXPER project, from October 2021 to October 2023. The conference aims to close and deliver the first results of an in-depth research process, resulting from the interdisciplinary collaboration of CY Cergy Paris Université (UMR Héritages) and the University of Lisbon (Institute for the Social Sciences). Titled "Glocalized experiences of heritage: Imaginaries, appropriations, and conflicts of use of world heritage historical and religious sites", the conference will explore the research leads developed in the EXPER project by expanding them to other theoretical frameworks and international case studies. We will interrogate the role and multiplicity of religiosities and rituals, both majority and minority, as well as their unique relationship with sites and their users. We will examine the impact of these sites in the construction and maintenance of global imaginaries and glocal communities, at a distance or on site. We will thus be able to question the contemporary challenges of management, conservation and mediation specific to each of these complex heritage sites, with multiple dimensions and affiliations, both religious and civil.*

Ce colloque représente l'aboutissement de la phase 1 du projet EXPER, d'octobre 2021 à octobre 2023. Il permet de clore et livrer les premiers résultats d'un processus de recherches approfondies, résultant de la collaboration interdisciplinaire de CY Cergy Paris Université (UMR Héritages) et de l'université de Lisbonne (Institute for the Social Sciences). Intitulé « Expériences et expertise du patrimoine glocalisé : imaginaires et appropriations des sites religieux du patrimoine mondial », il explorera les questions de recherche développées dans le projet EXPER en les ouvrant à d'autres cadres théoriques et d'autres études de cas internationales. Nous interrogerons le rôle et la multiplicité des religiosités et rituels, aussi bien majoritaires que minoritaires, ainsi que leurs relations singulières avec les sites et leurs usagers. Nous examinerons l'impact de ces sites dans la construction et l'entretien d'imaginaires globaux, mais également de communautés *glocales*, à distance ou sur place. Nous pourrions ainsi interroger les enjeux contemporains de gestion, de conservation et de médiation spécifiques à chacun de ces sites patrimoniaux complexes, aux dimensions et appartenances multiples, religieuses, civiles et politiques.



This work was funded by CY Initiative of Excellence (grant "Investissements d'Avenir" ANR-16-IDEX-0008)

Contact: [EXPER-research-project@cyu.fr](mailto:EXPER-research-project@cyu.fr)

Registration compulsory before/inscription obligatoire avant : 29/05/2023

<https://www.eventbrite.com/e/billets-exper-conference-1-206-2023-625303779437>

## 1 June / 1<sup>er</sup> juin

09h15            **Welcome / Accueil**

09h30            **Opening / Ouverture**

**Cécile Doustaly**, UMR Héritages, Cergy Paris Université (CY), Coordinator of the EXPER project

**Key Speaker, Maria Gravari-Barbas**, EIREST Research Centre, UNESCO Chair, Culture, Tourism and Development, University Paris I-Panthéon Sorbonne

10h00            **The Glocalism of Religious World Heritage / Le glocalisme du patrimoine mondial religieux**

**Chair: Fabrizio Panozzo, Ca'Foscari University-EUTOPIA**

- **Cécile Doustaly**, UMR Héritages, CY: "The EXPER project: *Exploring Glocal Experiences and Appropriation of World Heritage Religious sites to Inform Policies and Management*"
- **Sylvie Sagnes**, UMR Héritages, CNRS: "Le site de Paris Rives de la Seine. Visiter Notre-Dame à l'heure du tourisme de masse : expériences et perceptions d'usagers experts"
- **Clara Saraiva** and **Chiara Pussetti**, University of Lisbon-ICS; **Rodrigo Lacerda**, CRIA, Nova University-EUTOPIA, "*Rethinking heritage through art in Sintra: imageries, appropriations and the paradoxes of artistic interventions*"
- **Cécile Doustaly**, UMR Héritages, CY: "A comparative view of the exploratory case of Westminster's World Heritage site"

11h45            **Break**

12h00            **Preserving Memory / Préserver la mémoire**

**Chair: Clara Saraiva, University of Lisbon**

- **Susan Jenkins**, Westminster Abbey: "*The Queen's Diamond Jubilee Galleries*"
- **Maria João de Sousa, João Sousa Rego**, Parques de Sintra: "*The collective imaginary and the recovery of memory: the restoration of the Convent of Capuchos*"

13h00            **Lunch break**

14h30 - 16h30    **Multi-religiosity and Spirituality / Multi-religiosité et spiritualité**

**Chair: Anne-Julie Etter, CY Cergy Paris Université**

- **Véronique Dassié**, UMR Héritages, Cergy Paris Université: "Nature et sacré dans un patrimoine unescien mis à l'épreuve de la forêt de Notre-Dame de Paris"
- **Ruth Liberty Shalev**, Technion Israel Institute of Technology, ICOMOS Israel: "*Armageddon Then and Now*"
- **Marie-Hélène Chevrier**, Catholic Institute of Paris: "*World Heritage and the restoration of the religious character of Mont Saint-Michel: a marvel of institutional collaboration?*"
- **Iuliia Eremenko**, University of Warsaw: "*The role of local experts in protecting religious sites within the urban context of Toruń*"

18h00 - Visit of Notre-Dame de Paris' site

## 2 June / 2 Juin

9h30 **Accueil / Welcome**, Cécile Doustaly

9h35 **Opening / Ouverture**, Cyril Isnart, IDEMEC, Aix Marseille Université CNRS

9h45 **Conflicts and Identity-related Challenges / Conflits et enjeux identitaires**

**Chair: Anna Niedźwiedź, Jagiellonian University, Kraków**

- **Zeynep Aktüre**, Independent scholar, Izmir, Turkey: *“Spatial Segregation in Ritual Appropriations and (Re)Uses of “Ephesus” World Heritage Property: A Long-Term Overview”*
- **Charlotte Gasc**, IDEMEC/IREMAM, CNRS-Aix-Marseille Université: *“World heritage regime on a divided holy site: the case of the Cave of Patriarchs in Hebron and the Israeli-Palestinian conflict”*
- **Henrik Lindblad**, Expert and board member of ICOMOS International Scientific Committee PRERICO (Places of Religion and Ritual): *“Reflections on EXPER and the concept of Living Religious Heritage”*

10h45 **Break**

11h00 **Overcoming Tensions / Dépasser les tensions**

**Chair: Emma Bjorner, Centre for Tourism, Gothenburg University-EUTOPIA**

- **Mok Keng Kio**, University of Hong Kong: *“Smart Hybrid Space for Worshippers and Visitors in World Heritage Churches: Connecting Worship Places in the Urban Compact City of Macau during the Covid-19 pandemic”*
- **Anna Niedźwiedź**, Jagiellonian University, Kraków: *“Heritage community in the making: the Jewish Culture Festival in Kraków”*
- **Anne-Julie Etter**, UMR Héritages, CY Cergy Paris Université: *“South Asia at Westminster Abbey: from colonial legacies to contemporary representations and appropriations”*
- **Fabrizio Panozzo**, Ca’Foscari University-EUTOPIA (Venice), *“Boxing San Marco”*

13h00 **Lunch break**

14h15 **New Tourisms, New Ritual Practices / Nouveaux tourisms, nouvelles pratiques rituelles**

**Chair: Clara Saraiva / Sylvie Sagnes (in English and French)**

**Table ronde / Roundtable :** **Bénédicte Fichet**, Responsable du groupe CASA Notre-Dame de Paris  
**Henry de Villefranche**, Chapelain de la Cathédrale de Notre-Dame de Paris  
**Emma Bjorner**, Centre for Tourism, Gothenburg University-EUTOPIA  
**Gwenaëlle Bourdin**, Directrice, Evaluation Unit, ICOMOS International

**Teresa Patricio**, President, ICOMOS International: *“ICOMOS, creating sustainable research and training to understand the past and build the future”*

16h00 - 16h30 **Conclusions of the Conference / Conclusion du colloque**

**Cécile Doustaly**, UMR Héritages, Cergy Paris Université (CY), Coordinator of the EXPER project

### **EXPER Partner Research teams and experts / équipes partenaires du projet EXPER**

UMR 9022 Héritages : Culture(s), Création(s), Patrimoine(s) - Cergy Paris Université (CY) – EUTOPIA; Lisbon and Nova Universities (Lisbon) – EUTOPIA; Ca’Foscari University – EUTOPIA; Warwick University – EUTOPIA; Gothenburg University – EUTOPIA; EUTOPIA Tourism and Experience Connected Research Community

**EXPER Partners** : ICOMOS INTERNATIONAL, ENCATC, Cathédrale de Notre Dame de Paris, ICONEM, Centre des Monuments Nationaux, City of Paris. **Key speakers’ universities** : EIREST research Centre and Unesco Culture, Tourism and Development, Paris I-Panthéon Sorbonne University; UMR IDEMEC, Aix Marseille Université-CNRS

**Cécile Doustaly**, UMR Héritages, CY Cergy Paris Université-CNRS-Ministry for Culture, EXPER PI

Dr Cécile Doustaly, PhD, MA, BA, Dip Teach is Senior Lecturer / Reader (Habilitation Thesis) at CY Cergy Paris University (Greater Paris) and member of the research lab UMR CNRS Héritages: culture/s, patrimoine/s, création/s.

Cécile Doustaly headed for 8 years the Research Group on Arts and Heritage, CY. She created in 2014 and directs the Masters International Projects in Cultures and Tourism.

She was Fernandes Fellow 2020-2022, School of Creative Arts, Performance and Visual Cultures, University of Warwick, and has been a fellow of the School of Creative Arts, Performance and Visual Cultures since.

After graduating from the universities of the Sorbonne Nouvelle (British Studies) and Reading (Sociology), she completed a PhD at the Sorbonne Nouvelle, entitled *The Genesis of public support for the arts in England, from the democratization of culture to cultural Democracy (1851-1970)*.

Her research now centres on contemporary comparative urban and cultural policies and Heritage Studies, notably arts and heritage mediation, management and sustainable development issues, drawing on interdisciplinary methods and collaborations (Cultural and Area Studies, History, Sociology, Anthropology, Urban Studies).

She coordinates two international projects : [HERITRISK](#) / [OCC](#) on cultural policy, heritagization and the Olympic Games and [EXPER](#), which this conference is the conclusion of phase 1.

## Introduction to the [EXPER conference](#)

### **Experience and Expertise of Glocalised Heritage: Imagines and Appropriations of World Heritage Religious Sites**

This international conference aims to enlarge the discussion around the first results of the [EXPER research project](#), which studies the underexplored links between cultural imaginaries and the glocal uses of World Heritage sites characterized by both heritage and religious rituals. Although unique, such iconic sites generate powerful imaginaries in the eyes of spiritual, touristic, scholarly or civic communities, forming glocal spaces for sharing meanings and values. As Icons, they tended to uphold "Authorized Heritage Discourses" (Smith 2006), while more diverse narratives and discussion of "difficult heritage" (MacDonald, 2013) have been introduced recently. The sites also face divergent appropriation regimes and conflicts of uses. Since properties are inscribed by Unesco with a view to being preserved, we also wish to explore how the sites' very vulnerability to sudden or slow destruction (fire, floods, global warming, overtourism, etc.) impacts their relationship with users.

Our objective is to learn from the varied EXPERiences and diverse EXPERTise of publics, stakeholders and professionals to improve site conservation, management, interpretation and mediation. Three sites inscribed on the World Heritage List have served as our starting point: "Paris, Banks of the Seine" (including Notre-Dame de Paris), the "Cultural Landscape of Sintra" and the site of Westminster (including Westminster Abbey) in London.

This conference wishes to confront a larger variety of international case studies and complementary theoretical frameworks to explore the research questions developed in the EXPER project:

- How do World Heritage religious sites participate in the construction of glocal imaginaries, negotiating diverse interpretations?
- How are the specific management, use and mediation issues for such sites faced with mass tourism?
- Can these sites create a glocal community? Around which practices, values, spiritualities and with what effects?
- Are individual and collective emotions (Fabre, 2013; Smith, 2020) and discourses self or mutually reinforcing. How can they accompany social change?

We welcomed papers aiming to better understand the representations, experiences and multiscale appropriations associated to the sites to discuss the relationship between heritage, religion and spirituality.

Our aim is both to shed light on their fundamental role in the formation of global identities and to study their effects on the complexity of human interactions.

The conference will more specifically address, in a transversal way, the following issues: glocal circulations of religious / spiritual / heritage / civic / touristic / environmental beliefs, values, rituals, representations; users' emotions, experiences and appropriations; the effect of the Unesco inscriptions on imaginaries and site management; the sites' approach to intercultural and interreligious dialogue.

The conference gathers multidisciplinary contributions, based on theory or ethnography, from discourse to practice, from a diversity of social and human sciences, particularly those that will unveil the role of such sites in glocal communion or conflict, by exploring how heritage, spirituality and scales intersect in the following themes:

- **complex sites as universal commons or multifaceted commodities:** multi-ritualized, multi-heritagized, multi-spaced, multi-performative (religious/cultural/civic spaces and events, memorials, celebrations, etc.);
- **glocal imaginaries and appropriations from diverse publics:** past/present, onsite/remote, dominant/ minority rituals and neo spiritualities (narratives, participation, poly-sensoriality, digital, etc.);
- **mitigating conflicts:** stakeholder's surveys; digital mapping; inclusive interpretation and mediation; contact zones and shared events versus dissociating publics (price policy, time / space allocation, etc.);
- **heritage/religion/nature in competition or mutually reinforcing:** sacrality and spirituality in environmental cultures; vulnerabilities, conservation and sustainable development; etc.

With the support of our partners, our results will inform the training of professionals, the management of sites and the design heritage policies.

**EXPER Project Lead :**

**UMR Héritages culture/s, patrimoine/s, création/s**

**(Cergy Paris Université – EUTOPIA ; CNRS, Ministère de la Culture)**

**EXPER Partners :**

- ICOMOS International & its scientific committees on Cultural Tourism; Religious Heritage; Interpretation
- ENCATC (EU Research & training network in cultural management and policy);
- EUTOPIA Tourism Connected Research Community (lead: Gothenburg Univ.)
- ICONEM (3D reconstruction and Digital production firm)
- Cathédrale Notre-Dame de Paris, Chantier scientifique de Notre-Dame de Paris ; Ville de Paris & its museums ; Casa France ; Médiathèque du Patrimoine et de la Photographie (MPP) ; Fondation des Sciences du Patrimoine (FSP) ; Comité régional tourisme Ile de France (CRT)
- Institute for the Social Sciences, University of Lisbon & Nova University; Directorate General for Cultural Heritage (Portugal) ; Parques de Sintra – Monte da Lua ; ADP Association (Sintra) ; Alagamares Association (Sintra) ;
- Centre for Cultural and Media Policy Studies, SCAPVC-Arts Faculty / Institute for Advanced Studies, University of Warwick – EUTOPIA;
- Gothenburg University – EUTOPIA; Innovation Hub Experience Next Hub
- Ca'Foscari Univ. – EUTOPIA

**References (EXPER project participants in bold)**

Anderson, B. (1983) *Imagined Communities. Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism*. New York, Verso.

Anheier, H. K, Isar Y.R., eds (2011) *Cultures and Globalization: vol. 4. Heritage, Memory and Identity*. (2012), *Cultures and Globalization: vol. 5. Cities, Cultural Policy and Governance*, London, Sage.

Anheim, E., Etter, A-J., Glasson-Deschaumes, G., Liévaux, P., dir. (2019) *Les patrimoines en recherche(s) d'avenir*, Nanterre, Presses Universitaires de Nanterre.

- Appadurai, A. (1996) *Modernity at Large. Cultural Dimensions of Globalism*, Minneapolis, Minnesota UP.
- Bandarin F., Van Oers R. (2012), *The Historic Urban Landscape. Managing Heritage in an Urban Century*, Chichester, Blackwell Publishing.
- Bendix, R. F., Eggert, A., Peselmann A., eds (2013) *Heritage Regimes and the State*, Göttingen, Göttingen Studies in Cultural Property.
- Bendix, R. (2009), "Heritage between economy and politics: An assessment from the perspective of cultural anthropology", in L. Smith, N. Akagawa (eds.), *Intangible Heritage*, London, New York, Routledge, 253–269.
- Bennett, T. (2007) 'Making Culture, Changing Society: The Perspective of Culture Studies', *Cultural Studies*, 21(4/5).
- Berliner, D., Brumann, C., eds. (2016) *World Heritage on the Ground: Ethnographic Perspectives*, New-York, Berghahn.
- Bethmont, R., (2010) *L'anglicanisme, un modèle pour le christianisme à venir ?* Genève, Labor et Fides.
- Boyer, M., (2002), « Comment étudier le tourisme ? », *Ethnologie française*, vol. 32, no. 3, 393-404.
- Cardeira da Silva, M., **Saraiva, C.** (2022) "Curating Culture and Religion: Lusotropicalism and the management of heritage in Portugal", in E. van den Hemel, O. Salemink, I. Stengs, eds, *Managing sacralities: competing and converging claims of religious heritage*, London, Berghahn.
- Cerezales, N., Isnart, C., eds (2020) *The Religious Heritage Complex. Legacy, Conservation, and Christianity*, London, Bloomsbury.
- Clifford J., (1997) *Routes. Travels and Translation in the Late Twentieth Century*, Harvard, Harvard UP.
- Conord, S., Cuny, C., dir. (2014) "Towards a "visual turn" in urban studies? Photographic approaches", *Visual ethnography*, Vol 3, 1.
- Dallen, J. T., Olsen, D. H. eds (2006) *Tourism, Religion and Spiritual Journeys*, London, Routledge.
- Dassié, V.**, dir. (2014) *Des arbres au cœur d'une émotion. La fabrique d'un consensus patrimonial : le parc du château de Versailles après la tempête*, Paris, Les Carnets du Lahic n°9, Lahic/Ministère de la Culture.
- De Cesari, C. (2013), "Thinking through Heritage Regimes", in R. Bendix, A. Eggert, A. Peselmann (eds), *Heritage Regimes and the State*. Göttingen, Göttingen University Press.
- Decroly, J-M., ed. (2015) *Le Tourisme comme expérience. Regards interdisciplinaires sur le vécu touristique*, Montréal, Presses Universitaires du Québec.
- Derlon B., Jeudy-Ballini M. (dir.), (2015), Dossier "L'art en transfert", *Cahiers d'anthropologie sociale*, 12.
- Doustaly, C.**, ed., (2019a) *Heritage, Cities and Sustainable Development, Interdisciplinary Approaches and International Case Studies*, Brussels, Peter Lang, 2019.
- Doustaly C.**, (2019), "Comparative Visions of Heritage - Holistic Visions of Heritage?" in C. Doustaly, ed., *Heritage, Cities and Sustainable Development, op. cit.*, 223-234.
- Doustaly C.**, (2019b), "Heritage, Cities and Sustainable Development. Challenges and Opportunities between Theory and Practice" in Doustaly C., ed., *Heritage, Cities and Sustainable Development, op. cit.*, 13- 42.
- Doustaly C.**, (2019c), "Participatory Budgeting and Progressive Cities: Are London and Paris Listening to Their Own Voices?", in M. Douglass, R. Garbaye, K.C. Ho, eds, *the Rise of Progressive Cities East and West*, Singapore, London, New York, Springer, 117-136.
- Doustaly C.**, (2021 forthcoming) « Minorités ethniques, empowerment et appropriation à Londres : quelle gouvernance de la diversité après les jeux olympiques de 2012 ? », in R. Garbaye, C. Nativel, dir., *La gouvernance de la diversité culturelle à Londres*, Rennes, Presses Universitaires de Rennes.
- Duda, T. and Doburzyński, D. (2019) "Religious Tourism vs. Sacred Space Experience: Conflict or complementary interaction?," *International Journal of Religious Tourism and Pilgrimage*, Vol. 7, Iss. 5, 2019, Article 2. <https://arrow.tudublin.ie/ijrtp/vol7/iss5/2>.
- Etter A-J**, E. Anheim, G. Glasson-Deschaumes, P. Liévaux dir. (2019), *Les patrimoines en recherche(s) d'avenir*, Nanterre, Presses Universitaires de Nanterre, « Les passés dans le présent ».
- Fabre D., dir., (2013) *Émotions patrimoniales*, Paris, MSH/MC, Coll Cahiers d'Ethnologie de la France.
- Geismar, H. (2015) "Anthropology and Heritage Regimes", *Annual Reviews of Anthropology*, Vol 44, 71-85.
- Graburn, N., Gravari-Barbas, M., eds (2016) *Tourism Imaginaries at the Disciplinary Crossroads: Place, Practice, Media*, London, Routledge.
- Graburn, N. (1989), "Tourism: The Sacred Journey", in V. Smith (ed.) *Hosts and Guests: The Anthropology of Tourism*, Philadelphia, University of Pennsylvania Press, 17-32.
- Guillaume, M. (1980) *La Politique du patrimoine*, Paris, Éditions Galilée.
- Gössling, S. (2018). Tourism, tourist learning and sustainability: An exploratory discussion of complexities, problems and opportunities. *Journal of Sustainable Tourism*, 26(2), 292– 306.



- Hafstein, V. (2012), "Cultural Heritage", in R. Bendix, G. Hasan-Rokem (eds), *A Companion to Folklore*, Oxford, Blackwell, 500-519.
- Hall, S. (1999) "Un-settling 'the heritage', re-imagining the post-nation. Whose heritage?", *Third Tekst*, Vol 13, n. 49, 3-13.
- Harrison, R. (2013) *Heritage: Critical Approaches*, London, Routledge.
- Harrison R., DeSilvey C., Holtorf C., Macdonald S., et.al. (2020), *Heritage Futures. Comparative Approaches to Natural and Cultural Heritage Practices*, London, UCL Press.
- Holtorf C. (2015), "Averting loss aversion in cultural heritage", *International Journal of Heritage Studies*, 21(4), 405-421.
- Holtorf, C. (2018). Embracing change: how cultural resilience is increased through cultural heritage. *World archaeology*, 50(4), 639-650
- Holtorf, C. & Högberg, A. (Eds.) (2021). *Cultural heritage and the future*. London: Routledge.
- Isnart C., Testa A., (2020), "Reconfiguring Tradition(s) in Europe: An Introduction to the Special Issue". *Ethnologia Europaea*, 50 (1), 5-19.
- Jernsand, E.M.** & Goolaup. S. (2020). Learning through extra-ordinary experiences. In Dixit, S. (Ed.) *The Routledge Handbook of Tourism Experience Management and Marketing*, 173-182. Routledge.
- Johansson, M. (2012). Place Branding and the Imaginary: The Politics of Re-imagining a Garden City, *Urban Studies*, 49(16), 3611-3626.
- Jones, S. (2017). Wrestling with the Social Value of Heritage: Problems, Dilemmas and Opportunities. *Journal of Community Archaeology & Heritage*, 4(1), 21-37.
- King, A. (2007), Boundaries, Networks and Cities: Playing and Replaying Diasporas and Histories, in Çinar, A. and Bender, T. (Eds.), *Urban Imaginaries: Locating the Modern City*, 1–14, Minneapolis, MN: University of Minnesota Press.
- Kirshenblatt-Gimblett, B. (1998) *Destination Culture: Tourism, Museums, and Heritage*, Berkeley, California UP.
- Kolb, D. (1984). *Experiential learning: experience as the source of learning and development*, Englewood Cliffs, Prentice Hall.
- Kollner, T., Testa, A., eds, (2022) *Politics of Religion*, Berlin, Lit-Verlag.
- Lähdesmäki, T., Thomas, S., Zhu, Y. eds, (2019) *Politics of Scale: New Directions in Critical Heritage Studies*. Oxford, Berghahn Books.
- Macdonald, S. (2013) *Memorylands: Heritage and Identity in Europe Today*, London, Routledge.
- Mah A. (2012), Demolition for Development: A Critical Analysis of Official Urban Imaginaries in Past and Present UK Cities, *Journal of Historical Sociology*, 25(1), 151-176.
- Marcus, G. E. (1995) "Ethnography in/of the World System: The Emergence of Multi-sited Ethnography", *Annual Review of Anthropology*, Vol 24, 95-117.
- Meskel, L. (2013) "UNESCO's World Heritage Convention at 40: Challenging the Economic and Political Order of International Heritage Conservation", *Current Anthropology*, Vol 54, n.4, 483-494.
- Meyer, B., De Witte, M., eds. (2013) "Heritage and the Sacred". Special issue of *Material Religion: The Journal of Objects, Art and Belief*, Vol 9, n.3, 274–404.
- Niedźwiedz A., Baraniecka-Olszewska K. (2020), "Religious heritages as spatial phenomena: Constructions, experiences, and selections", *Anthropological Notebooks*, Vol. 26, Issue 3, 1-16.
- Nora, P. (1997) *Les Lieux de mémoire, Tomes 1-4*, Paris, Gallimard.
- Noyes D. (2005), "The Judge of Solomon: global protections for traditional and the problem of community ownership", *Cultural Analysis*, Vol 5, 27-56.
- Panozzo F.** (2020), *Sparkling museums: the marketization of art institutions in the heritage city*, Museum Marketization: Cultural Institutions in the Neoliberal Era, Routledge.
- Peloux G.**, (2020) "Gurōbaru jidai no toraberu raitingu - Murakami Haruki no kikōbun" ("Travel Writing in a Globalized World – Murakami Haruki's Travelogues"), I. Hitoshi, A. Bechler (eds.), *Bunka hyōshō to shite no Murakami Haruki (Murakami Haruki as a Cultural Symbol)*, Tokyo, Seikyūsha, 92-105 (French version to be published).
- Peralta, E., Anico, M., eds (2009) *Heritage and Identity: Engagement and Demission in Contemporary Society*, London, Routledge.
- Pussetti, C.**, ed. (2018) *Art-Based Ethnography. Experimental Practices of Fieldwork. Special Issue of Visual Ethnography*. Vol 7. n.1.

- Raulin, A., Rogers, S. C., eds (2015) *Transatlantic Parallaxes. Toward Reciprocal Anthropology*, New York, Berghahn.
- Sagnes, S.** (2019), « D'une quête l'autre : la visite de Notre-Dame », E. Anheim, **A-J Etter**, G. Glasson-Deschaumes, P. Liévaux, dir., *Les patrimoines en recherche(s) d'avenir*, Paris, Presses universitaires de Paris Ouest, 109-120.
- Reisinger, Y. (2013), Preface. In Y. Reisinger (Ed.) *Transformational tourism: tourist perspectives*. (xiixiv). Wallingford, UK: C ABI.
- Salazar, N. (2012). Tourism Imaginaries: A Conceptual Approach, *Annals of Tourism Research*, 39(2), 863–882.
- Saraiva C.** & Cardeira da Silva, M. (forthcoming 2021), "Curating Culture and Religion: Lusotropicalism and the management of heritage in Portugal", E. van den Hemel, O. Salemink, Irene Stengs, *Management of Religion, Sacralization of Heritage. Validating, authenticating and managing religious heritage*, Oxford, Berghahn Books.
- Saraiva, C.**, ed. (2020), "Enchanted places, heritage spaces", Catalogue of HERILIGION Exhibition, Lisbon, FLUL.
- Saraiva, C.** (2021), Organisation et animation d'une session de débat sur pluralisme religieux et patrimoine, Musée National d'Ethnologie, Lisbonne (avec représentants de 8 religions différentes (catholique, Bouddhiste, néo-Druidique, Shamanique, néo-paganisme, islam, hindoue, afro-brésilienne), 16 octobre 2021.
- Smith, L., (2006), *The Uses of Heritage*, London, Routledge.
- Smith, L., (2020), *Emotional Heritage*, London, Routledge.
- Sonius, M., (2016), "Visualizing the Past, Outlining the Present, Idealizing the Future. The Royal Palace of Pena as a Performative Space", *Artis, Revista de Arte e Ciências do Património*. Lisboa, FLUL, 4.
- Turner, V., 1996 (1969), *The Ritual Process*, London, Routledge.
- Smith, L., E. Waterton & S. Watson. (ed.) (2012), *The Cultural Moment of Tourism*. New York, Routledge.
- Turner, V., 1996 (1969), *The Ritual Process*, London, Routledge.
- Urry, J., Larsen J. (2011), *The Tourist Gaze 3.0*, London, Sage.
- Velasco, J. M. (2009) *El fenómeno místico. Estudio Comparado*, Madrid, Editorial Trotta.
- Vickery, J. (2016), « 'Public Authorship' et politique du lieu », M. Hohlfeldt, ed., *FAIRE LA CITÉ. Création et gouvernance des imaginaires urbains*, Bruxelles, La Lettre volée, 129-144.
- Voisenat, C., Hottin, C. dir. (2016), *Le tournant patrimonial* [The Heritage Turn], Paris, MSH.
- Watson, S., Staiff, R., Bushell R., eds. (2012), *Heritage and Tourism: Place, Encounter, Engagement*, London, Palgrave.
- Watson, S., Waterton, E. (2010) *Culture, Heritage and Representation: Perspectives on Visuality and the Past (Heritage, Culture and Identity)*. London, Taylor and Francis.
- Young, J. O., Brunk, C.G., eds. (2009), *The Ethics of Cultural Appropriation*, Chichester, Wiley-Blackwell.



## Keynote Speech

**Maria Gravari-Barbas**, IREST, Paris 1 – Sorbonne University

Maria Gravari-Barbas is Professor at the Institute for Research and High Studies on Tourism (Institut de Recherches et d'Études Supérieures du Tourisme, IREST) of Paris 1 – Panthéon Sorbonne University. She has a degree in Architecture and Urban Design (University of Athens, 1985), and a PhD in Geography and Planning. She was Fellow at Johns Hopkins University, Baltimore, USA.

She is the director of the EIREST, a multidisciplinary research laboratory focusing on tourism, mainly related to cultural heritage and development.

She is also the director of the UNESCO Chair "Tourism, Culture, Development" of Paris 1- Sorbonne University and the coordinator of the UNITWIN network of the same name, comprising more than 25 top level universities all around the World.

She is invited professor in different Universities in Europe, the States and Latin America. She is the author of several books and papers related to Tourism, Culture and Heritage.

## Concluding Remarks

**Teresa Patrício**, President, ICOMOS International

*"ICOMOS, creating sustainable research and training to understand the past and build the future"*

Teresa Patrício has an advanced Master degree in Conservation and a Ph.D. in Engineering Sciences on the "conservation of archaeological sites" (KU Leuven, Belgium). She is an independent architect, Heritage conservation specialist and visiting Professor at the Catholic University of Leuven since 2004 (KU Leuven, Belgium). Author of a wide range of publications and projects, she is known internationally for her work on conservation of archaeological sites. She worked as a consultant with various institutions, including UNESCO and the EU. Member of the ICOMOS Board of directors since 2017 she has been President of ICOMOS since 2020.

She has developed research, restoration projects, conservation and management assessments for some of the most significant archaeological sites in the Mediterranean area (Ephesus and Sagalassos, Turkey, WH Baalbek and Tyre, Lebanon). Author of numerous publications, she is the outgoing Editor of *Thema & Collecta* magazine (ICOMOS Wallonie-Brussels), member of the Editorial board of *The Journal of Cultural Heritage and Sustainable Development*, and member of the International Scientific Committee of the *International Journal of Architectural Conservation and Restoration* (Intrecci). She is member of Belgian Blue Shield and ICOMOS Belgium, of the ICOMOS International scientific committee on Training (CIF, since 2010). She was member of several ICOMOS working groups. She was President of ICOMOS Belgium and then Wallonia-Brussels (2014-2020) and representing it on the Belgium inter-federal Working Group for Protection of Cultural Property of the Inter-ministerial Commission on Human Rights (2014-2020).

## Visiting Notre-Dame in the age of mass tourism: Experiences and perceptions from expert-users

Sylvie Sagnes, UMR Héritages, CNRS

**Keywords:** Public survey, Notre Dame de Paris, Visitor experience, Mass tourism, Sacrality

Until April 15th, 2019, the visit of Notre-Dame de Paris had not attracted much attention, except for a few surveys. For the most visited monument in Paris, France and even the world, this relative disinterest may come as a surprise. But like so many other issues affecting Notre-Dame, its visits received renewed interest after the fire, and, in 2020, the EMOBI Working Group (Chantier scientifique Notre-Dame de Paris, CNRS, Ministry of Culture) devised the questionnaire "Coming to NDP, Experiences and perceptions". This was a somewhat unusual tool compared to the questionnaires usually used for public surveys, particularly because of its volume, which determines to a large extent the profile of the respondents, which we described as "expert-users".

During the conference, I will present and analyse the answers to the questions about the visit. The topic's main problematic is stamped in this paper's title: how do these besides "average" visitors (graduates and/or churchgoers and/or Parisians), experience the visit to Notre-Dame amidst crowds of tourists? How do they experience and perceive this heritage, which simultaneously belongs to them, others, and humanity at large? The statistical diagrams efficiently summarize the answers to the close-ended questions and arguably, do not call for much additional comment. In contrast, the responses to the open-ended questions "Comment if you wish" or "Specify" triggered by the "Other" or "Yes" / "No" answers to the single or multiple-choice questions provide a counterpoint that allows us to go beyond the expectations that shaped the phrasing of our questions.

### Bibliography

- Cohen, E. « Visiter Notre-Dame », *Ethnologie française*, T XXXII, n°3, 2002, 503-515.
- Erlande-Brandenburg A., « Notre-Dame de Paris », in *Les lieux de mémoire*, Tome III, Les France : Volume 1, « De l'archive à l'emblème », NORA Pierre (dir.), Paris, Gallimard, 1997, p. 359.
- Clément Gaesler, *Lectures ésotériques contemporaines de la cathédrale Notre-Dame de Paris, du XIX<sup>e</sup> siècle à l'incendie de 2019. Un édifice entre ruine et récits*, Mémoire d'étude (2<sup>ème</sup> année de 2<sup>ème</sup> cycle), (sous la direction de Gaspard Salatko, Paris, Ecole du Louvre, 2021.
- Musée du Louvre, *Rapport d'activité*, 2019 [[En ligne](#)]
- Sagnes, S. « D'une quête l'autre : la visite de Notre-Dame », in E. Anheim, A.J. Etter, G. Glasson-Deschaumes, P. Liévaux (dir.), *Les patrimoines en recherche(s) d'avenir*, PU Paris Ouest, Paris, 2019, 109-120.
- Sandras, A. « Regarder, contempler et visiter Notre-Dame de Paris au XIX<sup>e</sup> siècle. (Partie I. À vol d'oiseau », *L'Histoire à la BnF*, 30/08/2019 [[En ligne](https://histoirebnf.hypotheses.org/7372)] <https://histoirebnf.hypotheses.org/7372> ; Partie II. Les enjeux du regard », *L'Histoire à la BnF*, 15/04/2020 [[En ligne](https://histoirebnf.hypotheses.org/7803)] <https://histoirebnf.hypotheses.org/7803>)

### Biography

After a Master's degree in history at the University of Toulouse le Mirail, Sylvie Sagnes was trained in anthropology at the EHESS Toulouse in the Centre of Anthropology, then directed by Daniel Fabre. After joining the CNRS in 2001, her work contributed to the research programmes developed within the LAHIC, and then the IIAC, where she co-directed Axis 2 Culture until 2016. Her current collective responsibilities are all related to the expertise acquired in the field of heritage anthropology, and include the presidency of the Ethnopôle GARAE in Carcassonne, the Co-direction of the collection "Ethnologie de la France et des mondes contemporains", MSH/Ministry of Culture, the creation of the GIS "Patrimoines en partage" and the coordination of EMOBI axis 2, Notre Dame de Paris scientific project, CNRS/MC.

## Rethinking heritage through art in Sintra: imageries, appropriations, and the paradoxes of artistic interventions

Clara Saraiva, Chiara Pussetti, ICS, University of Lisbon

Rodrigo Lacerda, Nova University, Lisbon

**Keywords:** Cultural landscape of Sintra, ethnography-based art, contrasting utopias, glamour, nature.

In this paper we aim to think critically about the dynamics of spectacularization, tourism and eventification generated by the encounters between heritage, art, public space, UNESCO classifications and local communities. Some authors have expressed this tension in dialectics between the ‘carnival’ and the ‘spectacle’, as respectively, subversive event and strategic pageant. Using recent contributions on utopias, dystopias, retrotopias and heterotopias, we will analyze tensions and contrasts in the ecocultural landscape of Sintra, classified by UNESCO as “Cultural landscape”, since it combines palaces, castles, and a wonderful landscape, and is described as a model of Romantic monumental and natural heritage. Placed in front of the westmost point of Europe, the Roca Cape, it is reputed for its special energy, and the area of the Sintra mountain is used by multiple religions as a space for their ceremonies, offerings, and varied rituals. Sintra is considered a magical space, with a long history of religious and mystical uses. It is an ideal space to reflect upon the creation of utopian and retrotopian places, which bring together references that are historically, geographically and culturally distant, and represent conflicting ideals – from glamour and touristification to the contemplation of nature. Such contrasting images relate present and past, secular, and religious views: from the glamour of the enchanted Pena and Monserrate palaces to the rusticity, atonement, and relation with nature of the Capuchos convent or the mountain night trails. We will suggest how such analysis can inspire art-based events, with the interventions of artistic residences, bringing tourists and public to a reflection on such contrasts, which constitute the soul of Sintra and the basis for its reputation. Cinema and post-cinema will also be used as a research methodology and a scientific output to explore the embodied and sensorial dimensions of these folds of time and space.

### Bibliography

- Pussetti C. (Ed) 2018. “Art-Based Ethnography. Experimental Practices of Fieldwork.”, *Special Issue of Visual Ethnography*. Vol 7. N.1.
- Lacerda, Rodrigo, “Worlding a Mbya-Guarani heritage: from dissonant heritage to ontological Conflicts”, *International Journal of Heritage Studies*, 27 11 (2021): 1133-1148.
- Bauman, Z. 2017, *Retrotopia*, Cambridge, Polity Press.

## Biographies

**Clara Saraiva** (PhD 1999) is a social and cultural anthropologist, a senior researcher at the Institute for the Social Sciences, University of Lisbon (ICS-UL). She was a Visiting Professor at University of California Berkeley (2013), Brown University (2001-02 and 2008). and a Research Fellow at the Watson Institute for International Studies at Brown (2001-02 and 2008). She works on the anthropology of religion and ritual, death, medical anthropology and religion and heritage. She was the PI of the HERA project HERILIGION, analysing the relations between religion and heritage. She is the President of the Association of Portuguese Anthropology (APA), a board member of the World Council of Anthropological Associations (WCAA), a board member of the WCAA Ethics Task Force, and a past vice-president of the Society for International Ethnology and Folklore (SIEF). She is co-editor (with Peter Jan Margry, Meertens Institut and University of Amsterdam) of the Lit-Verlag series on Ethnology of Religion.

**Chiara Pussetti** (PhD in Cultural Anthropology, University of Turin, Italy, 2003) has lectured at graduate and post-graduate levels in Italy, Portugal, and Brazil and has researched and published extensively on the subjects of migration, healthcare, social inequality, suffering and well-being, creativity and public art in urban contexts. Chiara is PI of the ICS-UL team of the EXCEL Project (“The Pursuit of Excellence. Biotechnologies, enhancement, and body capital in Portugal”). She is the president and a founding member of the EBANO Collective ([www.ebanocollective.org](http://www.ebanocollective.org)), a non-profit artistic and curatorial collective that makes interventions in the public space based on social research, technological innovation and community engagement.

**Rodrigo Lacerda** is an anthropologist and documentary filmmaker. He holds a Ph.D. in Anthropology: Politics and Displays of Culture and Museology from the Faculty of Social and Human Sciences of the Universidade Nova de Lisboa (NOVA FCSH) and ISCTE-IUL, and a master's degree in Anthropology, specializing in Visual Culture. His PhD focused on the relationship between Indigenous cinema and heritage in Brazil. He also completed a postgraduate degree at the National Film and Television School (United Kingdom) and a BA (Hons) in Film and Broadcast Production at London Metropolitan University. He is a researcher at the Center for Research Network in Anthropology (CRNA) where he is the coordinator of the Visual Anthropology and Arts Laboratory (NAVA) and the Politics and of the Practices and Politics of Culture research group. He has been an invited assistant professor at NOVA FCSH since 2017 and held that position at the University of Coimbra from 2019 to 2020.

## The collective imaginary and the recovery of memory. The restoration of the Convent of Capuchos

*Maria João de Sousa, Rego João de Sousa, Parques de Sintra*

**Keywords:** Cultural landscape of Sintra, Nature, Rehabilitation, Community, Sacrality

The Convent of the Capuchos is a hermitic convent built from the 16th century onwards, partially excavated in the rock and making use of the cyclopean granite outcrops, around which one of the main centres of the monument developed - the church and sacristy, the sleeping quarters, refectory and kitchen. The convent complex represents a unique ecosystem, still preserved in its natural setting, a remote area of great natural beauty, inserted in the Cultural Landscape of Sintra. The rehabilitation targeted the main nucleus of the Convent, recovering roofs and wall coverings, and part of its integrated heritage. The interventions in the coverings corrected all the pathologies found, using ancestral techniques and materials. These works also included the identification, removal, disinfection and return of cork elements and coverings. The intervention was phased, allowing the evaluation and refinement of the restoration, and provided an authentic image of the Convent, returning structure, volume and materiality to a hermitic monument, maintained and renewed by generations of friars until 1834, thus consolidating authenticity in all these aspects. The Convent is closely related to the surrounding community, also prevailing through popular culture, legends and tales related to the mysticism of Sintra. This restoration also brought people back to the site, as it is an exemplary landmark of 16th century religiosity in Portugal, and stands out for its importance in preserving memory, reconnecting the space to the Community and contributing to its education and identity. Once the work was completed, a Convent Management and Enhancement Plan was developed with the aim of monitoring the state of conservation of the building, implementing preventive and corrective maintenance actions in order to minimise major interventions with the greatest impact on heritage.

### Bibliography

- Merveilleux, Charles Frédéric de – “Memórias intuitivas sobre Portugal”, in O Portugal de D. João V visto por três estrangeiros, tradução, prefácio e notas Castelo Branco Chaves, Lisboa, Ministério da Cultura, Biblioteca Nacional, 1983.
- Piedade, Frei António da (1728) – Espelho de Penitentes e Chronica da Provincia da Santa Maria da Arrabida, da Regular, e mais Estreita Observância da Ordem do Serafico Patriarcha S. Francisco, no Instituto Capucho. Tomo I. Lisboa Ocidental: Officina de Joseph Antonio da Silva, Impressor da Academia Real.
- Xavier, A. M. (2004) – Das Cercas dos Conventos Capuchos. Évora: Casa do Sul Editora / Centro de História de Arte da Universidade de Évora.

### Biographies

With a degree in History and Archaeology and post-graduate studies in Medieval Archaeology and Museology, **Maria João de Sousa** has coordinated archaeological research projects: Moorish Castle and Convent of the Capuchos - at Parques de Sintra - Monte da Lua, S.A. She also developed the Interpretation Centres of Moorish Castle, Cabo da Roca Lighthouse and Convent of the Capuchos. In the Management team of the Cultural Landscape of Sintra, she is responsible for the patrimonial conservation status of the Convent of the Capuchos, and projects of patrimonial rehabilitation such as the Sanctuary of Peninha and the Canal dos Azulejos of the National Palace of Queluz. **João Sousa Rego**, architect and director for built heritage at Parques de Sintra, oversees the maintenance, safeguarding and enhancement of the company's heritage. He is also the coordinator of Blue Green Corridor at Parques de Sintra, a regional project involving 3 municipalities, Sintra, Oeiras and Amadora. Prior to Parques de Sintra, he was Deputy of Secretary of State for Regional Planning and Nature Conservation for the areas of land management, urban planning and housing. For six years, he was president of the private association CISV Portugal, which promotes youth education for peace through intercultural and is currently its chairman.

## Westminster Abbey: The Queen's Diamond Jubilee Galleries

*Susan Jenkins, Westminster Abbey*

**Keywords:** Unescian heritage, Diverse tourism, Diamond Jubilee Galleries, cultural mediation, fabric preservation.

Westminster Abbey and its location next to the Palace of Westminster is part of a UNESCO World Heritage site. Over the one thousand years of its history, Westminster Abbey has been built, re-built and bombed, with additions and alterations to the building taking place in each generation. As a former Benedictine monastery and a 'Royal Peculiar', with many of the original buildings remaining identifiable and in situ (if not intact)– it has undergone several significant administrative changes consistent with the development of the Church of England. The Abbey combines its role as a vibrant working church with its importance as a major heritage attraction with a diverse, multi-cultural international audience – and local parishioners. This paper examines the issues surrounding the creation of a new museum gallery – 9000 square metres – within the untouched medieval attic space known as the 'triforium'. The Queen's Diamond Jubilee Galleries, which were opened by her late Majesty Queen Elizabeth II in 2018, were conceived to celebrate her Diamond Jubilee in 2012. They replaced a smaller existing museum in the Norman Undercroft of the Abbey in the Cloisters. The planning of the building work within a working church and heritage environment and the logistics of creating the gallery sit at the heart of EXPER2023 questions relating to heritage, religion and spirituality. Debates with the Dean and Chapter and the Canon Theologian on the role and expectations attached to the project – were coupled with market research into the interests and understanding of members of the public which helped to shape the gallery's approach to its interpretation, themes and language. At the same time, the conservation and architectural approach to working within a medieval environment were critical factors in developing a successful new gallery within an untouched medieval space.

### Bibliography

- S. Jenkins and T. Trowles, *The Queen's Diamond Jubilee Galleries*, Westminster Abbey, Scala, 2018
- *The Burlington Magazine*, January 2019, vol.161 (no.1390): 'Westminster Abbey and its collection'

### Biography

Dr Susan Jenkins FSA is Curator of Westminster Abbey. She was the lead curator and project manager for the Queen's Diamond Jubilee Galleries which opened in 2018 and cares for the Abbey collections. She is currently researching a catalogue of the monumental sculpture. She studied history at the University of Cambridge, took an MA in Art History at the Courtauld, secured an Andrew Mellon Fellowship at Yale and had curatorial roles at the Victoria and Albert Museum, Hampton Court Palace (Historic Royal Palaces), English Heritage and the J. Paul Getty Museum.

## Nature and sacred in Unescian heritage put to the test by the forest of Notre Dame de Paris

Véronique Dassié, UMR Héritages, CNRS

**Keywords:** Sacrality, Nature, Heritage value, Affective value, Unescian iconography

The heritage value of a building such as Notre Dame de Paris comprises multiple spiritualities, profane and sacred, expressed through reference to the vegetal materialities of its framework. Indeed, its destruction by the fire has stirred emotions conducive to the expression of an affective value feeding on multiple references to the sacred.

Regarding the UNESCO site that encompasses it, a larger area known as "Paris-Rives de Seine", which includes a multitude of buildings and urban elements spread around the river, the reference to the sacred is less obvious. Nevertheless, the articulation of the heritage value through the Unescian iconography of the inscribed site shows a complex alliance of naturalness and sacrality that stands open to a wide array of interrogations.

This research presents the way in which Unesco stages the Paris Rives de Seine site through images and the place given to nature and the sacred. Contrasted with the words of the site's enthusiasts and the actors involved in its reconstruction, this visual formatting allows us to grasp how the affective value taps into the dimensions of nature and the sacred. Drawing from the reflections on the irruption of the sacred in everyday life (Leiris 1994) and a secularization of the religious in the heritage (Riegl 1903), the paper aims to analyze the modalities wherein the identification of a heritage value relies on the narratives of the sacred and of nature and vice versa.

### Bibliography

- Aria Matteo et Dei Fabio, 2020, « Se sentir chez soi. Les sens et le sacré dans la culture matérielle domestique », *Anthropologie et sociétés*, vol. 44, n° 1, p. 75–93.
- Dassié Véronique, 2014, *Des arbres au cœur d'une émotion. La fabrique d'un consensus patrimonial : le parc du château de Versailles après la tempête*, Les Carnets du Lahic, Lahic/DPRPS/Direction du Patrimoine/ Ministère de la Culture).
- Leiris Michel, 1994, *L'Homme sans honneur. Notes pour Le Sacré dans la vie quotidienne*, Paris, éditions Jean-Michel Place.
- Fabre Daniel (dir.), 2013, *Emotions patrimoniales*, Paris, Editions de la MSH.
- Riegl Aloïs, 2013, *Le culte moderne des Monuments, son essence et sa genèse*, Paris, Seuil. [Der Moderne Denkmalkultus: Sein Wesen Und Seine Entstehung (1903)].
- Salatko, Gaspard, 2016, « Faire incarnat. Icônes et contagion du divin dans le christianisme orthodoxe », *Communication & langages*, n° 3, vol. 189, pp. 125-140.
- Tornatore Jean-Louis, 2017, « Patrimoine vivant et contributions citoyennes. Penser le patrimoine "devant" l'Anthropocène », *In Situ*, n° 33.

### Bibliography

Veronique Dassié is a Researcher at the UMR Héritages 9022, CNRS, Cergy Paris University and the Ministry of Culture. Since her PhD research, she has been working on affective commitments, intimacy and the genesis of objects of affection in the transformative processes of a common culture. After having conducted several investigations on heritage (domestic objects, migrations, trees and forests), she studies the utopias at work in forest attachments, the alliances between art and anthropology in the processes of valorization and cultural legitimization. She considers the intimate as an operator of consensus and as a cog in an infra-politics in the reformation of inhabited worlds.



## Armageddon Then and Now

Ruth Liberty-Shalev, Technion Israel Institute of Technology | ICOMOS Israel

**Keywords:** Glocal imaginaries, Biblical Archaeology, diverse tourism, pilgrimage, apocalypse

This talk will focus on the site the biblical Armageddon, present day Megiddo in Israel, and since 2005 part of the WH serial inscription 'Biblical Tels – Megiddo, Hazor, Beer-Sheba'. The site owes its prominence in Western psyche to the biblical doomsday prophecy of the battle of the End of Days, "The Day of the Lord", during which righteous believers will be saved and the heretics will perish in the battle at Armageddon (book of Revelations). A significant number of Christian tourists on their pilgrimage to the holy land devote hours of their packed schedules to this site, mainly due to this apocalyptic association. Archaeological excavations which have been taking place at the mound (Tel) of Megiddo since 1903 have yielded a wealth of significant finds. To date, the site exhibits various remains-city gates, palaces, stables and water systems- from 30 distinct archaeological eras, dating from the Neolithic and Chalcolithic eras (5000 BCE) up to the site's abandonment in the Babylonian era (4th century BCE). The story of King Josiah's death, commonly dated to 609 BCE and associated with the prophecy of Armageddon, naturally relates to a but a small and disputed part of these finds. Through a brief analysis of biblical themes of this serial World Heritage inscription, compared with the significantly more varied and secular archaeological finds on site, this talk will examine the profile of visitors to the site and explore its allure in the context of contemporary culture. It will conclude with a discussion about the interplay between scientific archaeological research, religious mythologies of epic proportions, and the role World Heritage signification plays in encouraging diverse tourism which responds to either of the two, and which yet again raises questions relating to the power of myth and spirituality over material realities.

### Bibliography

- Belhassen, Yaniv and Ebel, Jonathan (2009), *Tourism, faith and politics in the Holy Land: An ideological analysis of Evangelical pilgrimage*, in *Current Issues In Tourism*, Vol. 12(4), July 2009, pp. 359-378.
- Cline, Eric H. (2020), *Digging up Armageddon: The Search for the Lost City of Solomon*, Princeton Univ. Press
- Coomasaru, Edwin and Deichert Theresa (Eds) (2022), *Imagining the Apocalypse: Art and the End Times*, The Courtauld Research Forum, London.
- KEMPINSKI Aharon (1989), *Megiddo. A City-State and Royal Centre in North Israel*, in *Materialien zur Allgemeinen und Vergleichenden Archäologie*, Bd. 40. Beck, München.
- The State of Israel (2003)- *The Biblical Tels and Ancient Water Systems - Megiddo, Hazor, Beer Sheba*, Nomination File 1108, Unesco World Heritage List (website).
- Silberman, Neil Asher & Finkelstein Israel (2002), *The Bible Unearthed: Archaeology's New Vision of Ancient Israel and the Origin of Its Sacred Texts*, Touchstone, NY.

### Biography

Ruth Liberty-Shalev is a Visiting Professor at the Faculty of Architecture and Town Planning, Technion Israel Institute of Technology, Haifa, where since 2012 she leads the Conservation of Built Heritage Unit. She holds an MA (cum Laude) from Oxford Brookes University and is a practicing architect specializing in the conservation of archaeological sites and built heritage. Between 2008-2017 she served as head of the monitoring committee of the Israel National Commission to UNESCO, and on the Israeli delegation to UNESCO World Heritage Committees. Since 2022 she serves as Board member of ICOMOS Israel. Her practice, Ruth Liberty-Shalev Architecture & Conservation, operates from Haifa, Israel.

## World heritage and the restoration of the religious character of Mont-Saint-Michel: a marvel of institutional collaboration?

*Marie-Hélène Chevrier, Catholic Institute of Paris*

**Keywords:** Unescian heritage, Monasticism, Sacrality, Spirituality, Diverse tourism.

Since its classification as a Historical Monument in 1874, Mont-Saint-Michel, now State property, has become an international tourist attraction, both for its architecture and for its natural settings. It is therefore "Mont-Saint-Michel and its bay" that was listed as a UNESCO World Heritage Site in 1979. Even though the Centre des Monuments Nationaux is the assignee of the building, the return of a permanent monastic community to the Abbey in 1969 was a sign of the restoration of the Mount also as a high place of the Catholic Church of France. Gradually, the pastoral actors became structured: a "Pastoral Care of the Bay" was initiated in 2008, to contribute "to the spiritual influence of Mont-Saint Michel", followed with the creation of the Mont-Saint-Michel Foundation in 2011, in which the dioceses of Coutances (Normandy) and Rennes (Brittany) assembled. A collaboration ensued, with the Ministry of Culture, associations of lay volunteers and the actors of tourism via the Villes-Sanctuaires association. Secularisation has led to the revaluation of the sacred, which has become rarer in the public space (Chevrier, 2020) and many visitors come to Mont-Saint-Michel in search of a spiritual experience, linked to Christianity or esotericism. This paper, based on a survey of visitors, interviews with the various actors of the place, and on the analysis of tourist and ecclesiastical discourses, aim to study the strategies implemented by the local ecclesiastical actors whose perimeter of action is geographically reduced by the various national and international classifications, while the visitors have very diversified imaginaries and increasingly strong spiritual expectations, sometimes very distant from the original Christian identity of Mont-Saint-Michel. The internationalisation of the Mont due to its inclusion on the World Heritage List seems to have contributed to the redefinition of the religious identity not only of the Abbey but of the whole bay.

### Bibliography

- Chevrier, M.-H. (2020), *Espaces sacrés, tourisme et sécularisation dans les lieux de pèlerinage catholiques*, Paris, L'Harmattan, coll. Géographie et cultures.

### Biography

Author Marie-Hélène Chevrier is a Geographer, Associate Professor at the Catholic Institute of Paris, and member of the UR "Religion, Culture et Société" (EA 7403). Her research focuses on spatial practices of mobility (tourism, pilgrimage), perceptions and representations of space. She works in particular on sacred spaces in a context of secularisation.

## The Role of Local Experts in Protecting Religious Sites within the Urban Context of Toruń

*Iuliia Eremenkon, University of Warsaw*

**Keywords:** Unescian heritage, Local experts, polycentric governance, historical center, qualitative analysis.

The number of sites in the UNESCO World Heritage List increases every year. To effectively attend to the needs of the public, an increasing number of experts are included in the decision-making process regarding such sites. The main goal of this paper is to investigate the level of engagement of local experts in the decision-making process related to the protection of religious sites in cities whose historic centre has World Cultural Heritage status. This study uses the theory of governance with a special focus on the concept of polycentric governance to describe the decision-making system in cities whose historic centre has World Cultural Heritage status. Following McGinnis and Ostrom, in this research "polycentric governance" system is defined as "a complex combination of multiple levels and diverse types of organizations drawn from the public, private, and voluntary sectors that have overlapping realms of responsibility and functional capacities" (2012). This research uses the example of the city of Toruń (Poland), which medieval town received World Heritage status in 1997. Toruń is historically one of the religious centres of its region. The historical structure of the city has been preserved; however, the town experienced floods that have influenced the image of the modern city (Cyberski, et al. 2006). Empirically, the study is based on semi-structured interviews with those who, according to documentation of ICOMOS National Committee documents and city administrations, were involved as experts in World Cultural Heritage in Torun; local city activists; city administration and representatives from UNESCO and ICOMOS (as an advisory organisation of the World Heritage committee) International Office and National Committees. The second source of information is a qualitative analysis of ICOMOS National Committee documents and city administration documents about the people they invited as World Heritage experts.

### Bibliography

- Cyberski, J., Grześ, M., Gutry-Korycka, M., Nachlik, E., & Kundzewicz, Z. W. (2006). *History of floods on the River Vistula. Hydrological Sciences Journal*, 51(5), 799-817.
- McGinnis, M. D., & Ostrom, E. (2012). Reflections on Vincent Ostrom, public administration, and polycentricity. *Public Administration Review*, 72(1), 15–25.

### Biography

Dr. Iuliia Eremenko is an Assistant Professor at the Faculty of Political Science and International Studies, University of Warsaw, Poland. She is the principal investigator of the research project "Local experts in Polish and German World Heritage Cities: their role in polycentric management of heritage sites". She holds a PhD from the University of Bamberg, Germany. The topic of her doctoral thesis was "World Cultural Heritage in Germany and Russia: The Experience of Wismar, Stralsund, Veliky Novgorod and Pskov". She has been awarded international grants and scholarships at several institutions (e.g. the Marbach Weimar Wolfenbüttel Research Association, the Bielefeld University, the Performing Arts Fund Netherlands).

## Spatial Segregation in Religious Appropriation and (Re)Use as a Conflict Management Strategy at Ephesus. A Historical Overview

*Zeynep Aktüre, Independent scholar, Izmir, Turkey*

**Keywords:** ritual uses of World Heritage properties, Ephesus, spatio-temporal (dis)continuities, stakeholder variety, contemporary socio-economic values

“Ephesus” was inscribed on the UNESCO World Heritage List as a serial property of four components that include religious elements, starting from Neolithic figurines at “Çukuriçi Mound”. Continuity in religious significance and use up to contemporary Marian commemorations in the “House of St. Mary” has been among the attributes of the property’s Outstanding Universal Value. Yet, this is experienced differently by different groups at different spaces and times.

“Çukuriçi Mound” is closed to visitation, without a substituting presentation strategy. The “Ancient City”, on the other hand, is the fifth most-visited museumified site in Turkey with some two million annual visitors while the “House of St. Mary” receives 700-800 thousand and the Basilica of St. John on “Ayasuluk” around 150 thousand. While visitors to the “Ancient City” mostly engage in a forty-five to ninety minute guided “tourist ritual” among crowds along the main street’s restored Roman period monuments (including Celsus Library), religious rituals are held in the latter two monuments and the Church of St. Mary off the main tourist path, by different and smaller Christian communities on different dates. Despite having been among Ephesus’ *raison d’être*, the Artemision is excluded from both types of ritual use.

This paper observes such spatial and temporal segregation in modern re-uses of “Ephesus” to enable conflict avoidance between cultural tourists and various Christian communities with key doctrinal differences, as documented since the early nineteenth century. Some of these differences date back to Early Christian Ecumenical Council meetings at the site that firmed Ephesus’ prominence in the Christian tradition. This is bringing funding from global interest groups for the conservation and management of Christian sites and monuments while the property retains to be mainly an economic resource for most local stakeholders who do not culturally identify with either of its global “Roman” or “Christian” imaginaries.

### Bibliography

- J.T. Wood (1887). Discoveries at Ephesus, Including the Site and Remains of the Great Temple of Diana. Boston: James R. Osgood and Company
- Şükrü Tül (2008). Şirince. Once Upon a Time Çirince. Istanbul: Ege Yayınları.
- M.I. Erdost (2016) Şemdinli Röportajı. Ankara: Onur Yayınları.

### Biography

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Zeynep Aktüre (B. Arch, MSc in Architecture-Restoration, PhD in Architecture) has been teaching architectural design, theory and history of architecture, and cultural heritage management at Izmir Institute of Technology (IZTECH) in Turkey. Her current research focuses on UNESCO’s World Heritage Programme, conservation history and modern uses of cultural heritage property, and politics of cultural heritage management. She is a member of Ephesus Site Management Advisory Board (2012-), Turkish National Commission for UNESCO’s Tangible Cultural Heritage Committee (2014-), and ICOMOS ISC on Places of Religion and Ritual (PRERICO, 2017-), among others. Her publications on Ephesus focus on the presentation(s) and interpretation(s) of the Artemis Ephesia statues in Efes Museum; the site’s ritual use as compared to that of Çatalhöyük and capitalistic tourism use; values and management of “Ephesus” World Heritage property, excavation and conservation history of the Ancient Theatre of Ephesus, and the site’s memorial function. They highlight spatial segregation as a successful strategy to manage complexities stemming from the appropriation of a site with continued religious significance by multiple global religious communities and a sovereign state, which has prevented conflict at the local level, touching upon its consequences for World Heritage practices.

## World heritage regime on a divided holy site: the case of the Cave of Patriarchs in Hebron, and the Israeli-Palestinian conflict

**Charlotte Gasc**, UMR IDEMEC/IREMAM, CNRS-Aix-Marseille Université

**Keywords:** Heritagisation, Multi-religious heritage, Contested belongings, Management, Fabric preservation

This communication will introduce a study of the process of “heritagisation” of the old city of Hebron and the sacred Cave of Patriarchs.

This site was inscribed on the World Heritage List by the Palestinian Authority in 2017. For decades, this contested territory between two national entities has been the theatre of multiple religious traditions. Historically, the city developed around the Tomb of Patriarchs/Abraham Mosque, a sanctuary known, according to the Jewish, Islamic and Christian traditions, as the cave of the Abraham, Isaac, Jacob and their wives. Second regional holiest site after Jerusalem, it is an important place of worship for Jews and Muslims. Even though the Tomb of Patriarchs is a shared holy place, it has been divided into two zones, each religious group fighting for its legitimate historical and religious rights to the place. We can see this separation materialized by the construction of two different entrances after an assault in 1994.

This separation affects the visit of the site for tourism. Suffering by a lack of tourists, Palestinian associations have implemented alternative tourism. The access of the Tomb of Patriarchs is controlled by the Israeli army, defining which community can enter the site, visit one of the two sides for the Muslims and the Jews, or both for the Christians. These different actors produced practices for visiting the place for different communities.

Recognized as a Palestinian world heritage site in this conflictual context, the sharing of meanings and values of both Israelis and Palestinians leads to divergent heritage regimes and conflicts of use. Who are the actors of the conservation and the management of the site? How do they transform the Tomb of Patriarchs by thinking and practicing it in different way? How does it enhance the division and competition for the practice of the place? How does the conflict affect the material preservation of the site? How does it create modalities of visit? How does this heritagisation lead to divergent regimes of site conservation and management, and a contradictory interpretation of the heritage values authenticity, integrity and gestion? This communication intends to explore the social, religious and political effects of the designation of this holy divided city as a heritage site; and the contradictory heritage practices on the ground prompted by UNESCO’s recommendations.

### Bibliography

- Bendix, Regina, Arnika Peselmann, et Aditya Eggert. 2013. *Heritage Regimes and the State*. Göttingen Studies in Cultural Property. Göttingen.
- Brumann, Christoph, et David Berliner. 2016. *World Heritage on the Ground: Ethnographic Perspectives*. Berghahn Books. Oxford.
- Smith, Laurajane. 2006. *Uses of heritage*. Routledge. London.

### Biography

Charlotte Gasc is currently in 2<sup>nd</sup> year of PhD in anthropology at the IDEMEC and IREMAM (Aix-Marseille Université) in Aix en Provence, supervised by Cyril Isnart and Norig Neveu. Her thesis research deals with the process of inscription of the Old city of Hebron on the World Heritage List. Her research interests focus on cultural and religious heritage, cultural diplomacy, and UNESCO issues in Israël-Palestine.

## Reflections on EXPER and the concept of Living Religious Heritage

*Henrik Lindblad, Expert and board member of ICOMOS International Scientific Committee PRERICO (Places of Religion and Ritual)*

**Keywords:** Living Heritage Approach, religious heritage, heritage values, adapted reuse, heritage groups

My presentation will reflect upon one of the recent paradigms of research on and management of religious heritage, the Living Heritage Approach and how it relates to contemporary interpretation, development and research on heritage sites. The concept of living heritage can be seen as an evolution and incorporation of the existing paradigms of material-based and values-based conservation, where the former aims at saving monuments and preserving their physical properties, the latter focuses on protecting values, generally based on tangible heritage, which are defined by various stakeholders, such as local communities, owners, experts and heritage authorities.

The Living Heritage Approach is not necessarily a substitute for earlier approaches, but a complementary development which can even be regarded as an improvement, adapted to deal with any category of heritage including intangible heritage. However, since the concept can be regarded as based on traditional use, that is worship or religious rituals performed by a faith community having ownership of the site, the Living Heritage Approach is not always useful concerning development of redundant or even abandoned sites by engaging other or new heritage groups.

Drawing on a few cases studies, this paper discusses how the concept can be broadened to be more inclusive and facilitate new interpretation and development of a site's heritage values and through this, possibly regenerating urban or rural areas for the benefit of local communities, traditional or new heritage groups, organisations and individuals.

### Bibliography

- Lindblad, Henrik (2022). "Living Religious Heritage and Continuous Use". In Olimpia Niglio, *Intercultural Dialogue: Places of Religion and Rituals*. Springer Nature.
- Lindblad, Henrik, Eriksson, Johan & Gustafsson, Christer (2022). "Caroli Church. A Resource for Urban Regeneration?". In *Esempi di Architettura, International Journal of Architecture and Engineering*. EdA, Vol. 9, n. 1, 2022.
- Poullos, Ioannis. (2014). *The past in the present: A living heritage approach – Meteora, Greece* Ubiquity Press.
- Wijesuriya, Gamini. (2018). "Living heritage". In Alison Heritage, & Jennifer Copithorne (Eds.), *Sharing conservation decisions: Current Issues and Future Strategies* (pp. 43–56). ICCROM.

### Biography

Henrik Lindblad is a researcher, art historian and heritage consultant, specialized in ecclesiastical art, architecture and heritage management. He has worked as coordinator, senior advisor and strategist for the National Heritage Board, the Ministry of Culture and the Church of Sweden. He is co-founder, Treasurer and former Vice-President of ICOMOS International Scientific Committee PRERICO (Places of Religion and Ritual). He is one of the founders of the European organisation Future for Religious Heritage (FRH), member of its council and co-chair of the FRH Scientific Advisory Committee. In March 2023 he successfully defended his PhD-thesis *Ecclesiastical Heritage in a New Era* at the Department of Art History, Uppsala University.



## Heritage community in the making: the Jewish Culture Festival in Kraków

**Anna Niedźwiedź**

*Institute of Ethnology and Cultural Anthropology Jagiellonian University in Kraków*

**Keywords:** Touristification, gentrification, Jewish heritage, restoration, experience, interfaith relations

Kraków's historic center inscription on the World Heritage List in 1978 included the Old Town, Wawel Hill cathedral and castle as well as the Kazimierz District with its complex Christian and Jewish heritages. However, till mid 1990s the Kazimierz Jewish quarter, with its synagogues, mikvahs, prayer houses and cemeteries, was in a state of material decline. Abandoned houses and synagogues devoid of their old owners and heirs were telling witnesses to the tragic history of the Kraków's Jewry. The post-communist transformation in Poland in the 1990s led to the rediscovery of the Kazimierz Jewish quarter, the renovation of its material tissue as well as its rapid touristification and gentrification. Discourses concerning the Jewish heritage of Kazimierz started to be created by various local and global actors. The Jewish heritage also became a part of the city's promotional strategy.

In this paper I will focus on the annual Jewish Culture Festival in Kraków. Initiated in 1988 as a small local event organized by two Polish activists, who got interested in "Jewish culture", it is now one of the biggest annual happenings in the city. The experiential dimension of the Festival seeks to recover the district's once silenced Jewish heritage, bringing also questions about the role played by this heritage within the more general image of Kraków's UNESCO site. During the last 35 years the Festival has attracted a significant glocal audience, as well as numerous local and international volunteers, artists, scholars and institutions. Drawing on ethnographic material collected at several editions of the Festival I will focus on this remarkable "heritage community" and its interactions with recently reviving Jewish religious communities in Kraków. The Festival triggers debates about the Polish-Jewish and Christian-Jewish relations, heritage ownership and appropriation, Shoah commemorations and the heritagization of the Jewish religious sites in the absence of its original heirs.

### Bibliography

- Lehrer Erica, Meng Michael (eds.), *Jewish Space in Contemporary Poland*, Indiana University Press, Bloomington and Indianapolis 2015.
- Murzyn Monika A., *Kazimierz: The Central European Experience of Urban Regeneration*, International Cultural Centre Cracow, Kraków 2006.
- Geneviève Zubrzycki, *Resurrecting the Jew: Nationalism, Philosemitism and Poland's Jewish Revival*, Princeton University Press 2022.

### Biography

Anna Niedźwiedź is an associate professor at the Institute of Ethnology and Cultural Anthropology, Jagiellonian University, Kraków. As a visiting professor she taught at the USA: at SUNY Buffalo (2006-2007) and Rochester University (2011). Her research focusses on the anthropology of religion, the anthropology of space and the heritagization of religion. She has published several books and numerous articles drawing on ethnographic fieldwork conducted in Poland and Ghana. Between 2016 and 2020 she served as a Principal Investigator in the international consortium HERILIGION funded by HERA and dedicated to the study of the "heritagization of religion and the sacralization of heritages in contemporary Europe".



## South Asia at Westminster Abbey: from colonial legacies to contemporary representations and appropriations

Anne-Julie Etter, UMR Héritages, CY Cergy Paris Université

**Keywords:** South-Asia, Post-colonial relations, glocal belongings, glocal uses, commemoration

The relationships between South Asia and Westminster Abbey can appear, at first sight, as a peripheral or anecdotal topic considering the complex and multifaceted history of this World Heritage site and the variety of publics and uses that are attached to it. Yet this example offers an interesting case study for enquiring into the diversity of cultural imaginaries and experiences associated to the place and examining its glocal uses.

The monument and its immediate surroundings display several commemorative objects highlighting the relationships between Britain and its former colonial possessions in South Asia. These memorials comprise, amongst others, the Crimea and Indian Mutiny Memorial, the Memorial for the members of the Indian Civil Service from 1858 to 1947, the Tomb of the Unknown Warrior, and the statue of Gandhi that has recently been erected in Parliament Square. South Asia is also represented through special events that take place at the abbey, such as the ceremonies and performances organized for Commonwealth Days. For India's Republic Day (26 January) and Pakistan Day (23 March), Indian and Pakistani flags are raised on the rooftop of Westminster Abbey and special evenings are organized in the presence of members of the High Commissions for India and Pakistan.

This communication aims at unravelling and interpreting the various connections between Westminster Abbey and South Asia, at the crossroads of heritage, religion, politics and empire. I will analyze the set of objects, symbols and events at Westminster Abbey that both illustrate and derive from the colonial and postcolonial relationships between Britain and South Asia. I will also examine the various ways through which South Asians have experienced and appropriated the place since the 18<sup>th</sup> century. For doing so, I will examine testimonials left by South Asian visitors during the colonial period, while studying the contemporary practices and representations of South Asian tourists and British people of South Asian origins when visiting the place.

### Bibliography

- Bremner, Alex. "‘Imperial Monumental Halls and Tower’: Westminster Abbey and the Commemoration of Empire, 1854-1904." *Architectural History*, 47, 2004, p. 251–82.
- Feilden, Bernard M. "Is Conservation of Cultural Heritage Relevant to South Asia?", *South Asian Studies*, 9-1, 1993, p. 1-10.
- Travers, Robert. "Death and the Nabob: Imperialism and Commemoration in Eighteenth-Century India." *Past & Present*, 196-1, 2007, p. 83–124.

### Biography

Anne-Julie Etter is associate professor in history at CY Cergy Paris Université, where she teaches Indian history and heritage studies. Her research deals with the documentation, preservation and transmission of cultural goods in South Asia during the 18<sup>th</sup> and 19<sup>th</sup> centuries. She also examines heritage practices and issues in contemporary India. She is the scientific coordinator of the "Fondation des sciences du patrimoine" (Foundation for Cultural Heritage Science), which gathers French universities, research centers and cultural establishments around common research projects on tangible cultural heritage. <http://www.sciences-patrimoine.org/>

## Smart Hybrid Space for Worshippers and Visitors in World Heritage Churches: Connecting Worship Places in the Urban Compact City of Macau during the Covid-19 pandemic

*Mok Keng Kio, The University of Hong Kong*

**Keywords:** Sacred spaces, Smart Hybrid Space, Adaptive Liturgy, Macau WHS, Urban Cultural Landscape, digitalization, Covid

Macau is a place of East meets West for over 400 years at the south-east coast of China. It was ruled by Portugal Government for over 400 years before the establishment of Macau Special Administrative Region of China in 1999. In 2005, "The Historic Centre of Macau" was granted the World Heritage Award by UNESCO. Historic Chinese temples and catholic churches are included in this World Heritage zone at the same time.

Macau is the most compact city with highest casino gaming return in the world before the Covid-19 pandemic. About 90% of Macau's income was generated by tourists from all over the world. The over 30,000,000 counts of annual visitor made the worship places in "The Historic Centre of Macau" very crowded.

This paper will discuss the enormous threat brought by tourists to the use of heritage churches of "The Historic Centre of Macau" before and during the Covid-19 pandemic. Some of the crowded control, zone planning, function segregation between heritage churches and adaptive liturgy newly introduced by the local diocese which helped to create new perception of places of religion and ritual will be discussed. How the smart hybrid adaptive physical and online patterns of worship in diocese and parish level be implemented at the historic churches in this most compact city on world will be elaborated. Possible good practices and challenges to maintain significance and authenticity for the religious places and ritual of these world historic churches in the post-pandemic period will be highlighted.

Macau's unique example of micro-managing spatial transition in space, time and order tangibly and intangibly of the world heritage churches in successfully conserving worship space without affecting ritual significance while inviting public to appreciate the world heritage without border enlightens all other religious heritage in the world.

### Bibliography

- Clayton, Cathryn Hope. 2002. "Discourse on the City: Identity Formation and Urban Change in Contemporary Macau," in *Review of Culture International Edition* 3, July 2002, pp. 58-81, Macau: Cultural Affairs Bureau.
- Keng Kio, Mok, 2010. *Macau: Walk to Global Vision: Driving Heritage Development by World Heritage Award*, Paris: Paris ICOMOS. <http://openarchive.icomos.org/id/eprint/1110/>

### Biography

Mok Keng Kio was trained in architecture and architectural conservation in The University of Hong Kong with solid public administration and education planning experience in Hong Kong and Macau. Apart from active participation to international heritage conference, she also contributed to conservation projects and website design of heritage churches in Hong Kong and Macau. She is at present Editor of the Catholic Diocese of Macau and instructor of the Gifted Program of The Chinese University of Hong Kong to inspire creativity of primary and secondary school students by architectural design and world heritage education programme. Her research focuses on cultural landscape, heritage management, religious architecture and historic gardens with special interest in the urban heritage of Macau.

## "Boxing San Marco"

**Fabrizio Panozzo**, *Research Institute for Digital and Cultural Heritage, Ca 'Foscari University*

**Keywords:** Basilica of San Marco, flood barriers, panopticism, over-tourism, heritage display

The Basilica of San Marco is a famous religious destination in Venice that attracts millions of visitors every year. Unfortunately, the city's geography makes it vulnerable to flooding, which has been a threat to the preservation of the Basilica for centuries. To address this issue, the city has implemented several flood protection measures, including fixed glass flood barriers around the Basilica. This approach raises questions about how this UNESCO World Heritage site is managed and symbolized. This paper explores the institutional and managerial decisions that led to the installation of the glass barriers, examines the symbolic significance of enclosing a World Heritage site, and considers the challenges that tourists and residents face when using such sites.

The installation of the glass barriers "closes by making visible" and thus raises questions about the symbolic meaning of enclosing a UNESCO World Heritage site. On the one hand, the barriers can be seen as a necessary measure to protect the site's cultural and religious significance. On the other hand, the barriers also raise concerns about the impact of enclosing a cultural and religious site.

Can it be seen as an attempt to protect San Marco from over-tourism?

And what should we make of the return of the glass box as a dispositive of heritage display?

One theoretical framework that could be applied to the idea of "Closing while Making it Visible" and the glass barriers around the Basilica of San Marco is Michel Foucault's concept of panopticism.

### Bibliography

Gazzato, S., & Toninato, M. 2016, The Venetian Lagoon Mobile Barrier Project: Features and Costs. In *Coastal Protection in the Aftermath of Hurricane Katrina* (pp. 181-196). Springer, Cham.

Scattolin, M., & Tassinari, C., 2016. The Mose Project and the Protection of Venice from High Waters: An Environmental Accounting Perspective. *Environmental Management and Governance*, 5(1), 44-56.

Panozzo Fabrizio, 2020, Sparkling museums: the marketization of art institutions in the heritage city, *Museum Marketization: Cultural Institutions in the Neoliberal Era*, Routledge.

UNESCO, 1972, Convention concerning the protection of the world's cultural and natural heritage. United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization.

### Biography

**Fabrizio PANOZZO** is Professor of Management at Ca 'Foscari University. In the last decade his research and teaching have focused on the various forms of interaction between management and artistic, cultural and creative processes. More recently he has conducted a series of research projects on "Industry, Culture, Creativity and Local Development" (2015) on the relationship between cultural productions and urban regeneration, "Art & Business" (2017) which introduced the idea of "artification" of business organizations thanks to the presence of artists and "Theatre, Research, Innovation" (2018) on the role of digital technologies as a bridge between performing arts and managerial performance. He's currently coordinating two European projects aimed at generating "creative atmospheres" based on strategic partnerships between cultural institutions and business firms.

## Roundtable: New tourisms, new ritual practices

*Chair: Clara Saraiva and Sylvie Sagnes - in English and French*

### **Bénédicte Fichet, C.A.S.A Notre Dame de Paris**

Bénédicte Fichet has been Head of the CASA association of Notre-Dame guide-lecturers since 2019.

The group was created in 1972 as part of the CASA association (Communautés d'Accueil dans les Sites Artistiques/Host communities in artistic sites) brings together volunteers who welcome and guide visitors daily in a dozen languages. Since the 2019 Fire, visits are held outside the cathedral.

She organised a study day, *Notre-Dame de Paris, between art, history et spirituality (Notre-Dame de Paris, entre art, histoire et spiritualité)* in October 2022 at the Collège des Bernardins in Paris.

Her professional capacity, is Heritage curator at the National Archives.

### **Henry de Villefranche, Chaplain of Notre-Dame de Paris**

Henry de Villefranche, born in 1955, has been a priest of the diocese of Paris since 1982, after a Master's in Theology (ICP). He obtained a Canonical Degree in biblical sciences (PIB) (Rome, 1990).

He is a Lecturer at the Notre-Dame Faculty, Collège des Bernardins. He has been Chaplain at Notre-Dame de Paris since 2017. He is also a Chaplain of the CASA Notre Dame.

He has been tasked to inform the interior design of the Cathedral Notre-Dame de Paris since 2021.

### **Gwenaëlle Bourdin, ICOMOS International**

Ms. Gwenaëlle Bourdin is Director of the World Heritage Evaluation Unit at the ICOMOS International Secretariat. She has a degree in Economics, History and History of Art and joined ICOMOS in 1998 after obtaining a master in History and Management of French and European Heritage (Panthéon-Sorbonne University). She is currently responsible for the coordination of ICOMOS work on Tentative Lists, Upstream processes and nominations of cultural and mixed properties to the World Heritage List. She attended almost all World Heritage Committee sessions since 2002 on behalf ICOMOS. She also contributed to the drafting of the reference manual "Preparing a World Heritage nomination" and the "Guidance on developing and revising World Heritage Tentative Lists" prepared by the Advisory Bodies in collaboration with the World Heritage Centre. She is involved in the joint ICOMOS/IUCN project "Connecting practice" which explores new methods and practical strategies to better recognize and encourage interrelationships between natural and cultural heritage within World Heritage sites. She has played an active contribution to the recent nomination reform processes, including the introduction and operationalization of the Preliminary Assessment process to improve the quality of nominations and evaluation processes. She has also participated in numerous expert capacity building workshops around the world on the fundamental principles of the World Heritage Convention.

### **Emma Björner, Centre for Tourism Gothenburg University-EUTOPIA**

Emma Björner is a researcher at Gothenburg Research Institute (GRI), the School of Business Economics and Law, Gothenburg University. At GRI Emma works in the research project The Role of Tourism in Multicultural Societies (TiMS) and studies sustainable tourism and how the plurality of places and destinations is communicated, represented and experienced. At GRI, Emma is also part of the Centre for Consumption Research and the research programme Managing Big Cities. She is also a member of the board and management group at GRI.